

~~FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY~~
~~Sensitive Material~~



**The Inspector General
of the Air Force**

Report of Investigation (S8011P)

Maj Gen Michael J. Carey

October 2013

**DO NOT OPEN COVER WITHOUT A NEED TO KNOW--
PROTECTED COMMUNICATION TO IG**

~~Sensitive Material~~
~~FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY~~

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (AF/IG) or designee.

~~FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)~~

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Introduction.....	1
II. Scope and Authority	1
III. Background	2
IV. Chronology	4
V. Allegation, Findings, Standards, Analysis and Conclusion	6
VI. Summary	42
List of Exhibits.....	43

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAXIG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

REPORT OF INVESTIGATION (Case S8011P)

CONCERNING

MAJOR GENERAL MICHAEL J. CAREY

PREPARED BY

COLONEL [REDACTED]

October 2013

I. INTRODUCTION

This investigation was directed in response to concerns raised by Ms. [REDACTED], a [REDACTED] on the staff of the Office of the Secretary of Defense, to her leadership regarding Maj Gen Michael J. Carey's conduct during a trip to Russia from 14-18 Jul 13. These concerns were forwarded to the Secretary of the Air Force Inspector General for action. Ms. [REDACTED], having first-hand knowledge of the facts regarding an exercise which took place in Moscow, Russia, from 14-18 Jul 13, alleged improper conduct on the part of Maj Gen Carey, Commander, 20th Air Force (20 AF/CC), Francis E. (F.E.) Warren Air Force Base, Wyoming (WY) during that temporary duty assignment.

b6
b7c

The IO looked into whether Maj Gen Carey violated Article 133 of the Uniform Code of Military Justice (UCMJ), conduct unbecoming an officer and a gentleman. (Ex 9) The Investigating Officer (IO) interviewed seven witnesses from 1-14 Aug 13. Although the testimony varied slightly between individuals, and no one individual was present with Maj Gen Carey at all times, the IO found there was consistency in the description of Maj Gen Carey's behavior. Maj Gen Carey was notified of the allegations on 29 Jul 13, 11 days after returning from the trip. Maj Gen Carey was interviewed last, in person, on 4 Sep 13.

Because Maj Gen Carey was alleged to have committed an offense under the UCMJ he was therefore treated as a suspect, and the IO read Maj Gen Carey his Article 31 rights.

II. SCOPE AND AUTHORITY

The Secretary of the Air Force has sole responsibility for the function of The Inspector General of the Air Force.¹ When directed by the Secretary of the Air Force or the Chief of Staff of the Air Force, The Inspector General has the authority to inquire into and report on the discipline, efficiency, and economy of the Air Force and perform any other duties prescribed by

¹ Title 10, United States Code, Section 8014

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SA/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

the Secretary or the Chief of Staff.² The Inspector General must cooperate fully with The Inspector General of the Department of Defense.³ Pursuant to Air Force Instruction (AFI) 90-301, *Inspector General Complaints Resolution*, 23 Aug 11 (Incorporating Change 1, 6 Jun 12), paragraph 1.13.4, The Inspector General has oversight authority over all IG investigations conducted at the level of the Secretary of the Air Force. (Ex 10:2)

Pursuant to AFI 90-301, paragraph 1.13.3.1, the Director, Senior Official Inquiries Directorate (SAF/IGS), is responsible for performing special investigations directed by the Secretary, the Chief of Staff, or The Inspector General and all investigations of senior officials. AFI 90-301 defines senior official as any active or retired Regular Air Force, Air Force Reserve, or Air National Guard military officer in grades O-7 (brigadier general) select and above, and Air National Guard Colonels with a Certificate of Eligibility (COE). Current or former members of the Senior Executive Service (SES) or equivalent and current and former Air Force civilian Presidential appointees are also considered senior officials. (Ex 10:3-8)

One of several missions of The Inspector General of the Air Force is to maintain a credible inspector general system by ensuring the existence of responsive complaint investigations characterized by objectivity, integrity, and impartiality. The Inspector General ensures the concerns of all complainants and subjects, along with the best interests of the Air Force, are addressed through objective fact-finding.

On 29 Jul 13, The Inspector General approved that SAF/IGS conduct an investigation into an allegation of misconduct by Maj Gen Michael J. Carey, 20 AF/CC located at F.E. Warren AFB, WY. The case was assigned to Col [REDACTED], who holds a SAF/IG appointment letter dated 7 Nov 12, and the investigation started on 30 Jul 13.⁴

b6
b7c

III. BACKGROUND

Trip Purpose

The US delegation traveled to Moscow for a Bilateral Presidential Commission, Military Cooperation Working Group Event. (Ex 7:2) This US-Russian Federation (RF) Nuclear Security Exercise 2013, held 16-17 July, 2013 was an exercise conducted by the RF Ministry of Defense (MOD). (Ex 7:2) Defense Threat Reduction Agency (DTRA) was tasked by the Joint Staff and OSD Policy to prepare, plan, coordinate and fund DoD participation in the exercise. (Ex 7:1)

² These authorities are outlined in Title 10, United States Code, Section 8020

³ Title 10, United States Code, Section 8020(d)

⁴ IO appointment letter. (Ex 2)

Exercise Background

Mr. [REDACTED] for this event, stated it was an exercise between the United States and the Russian Federation to provide lessons learned and review capabilities with regard to safeguarding nuclear warheads during convoy operations. (Ex 21:2-3) The US-RF Nuclear Security Exercise was a reciprocal event to the US-led Crimson Rider 11 exercise. Mr. [REDACTED] stated, "We hosted a Russian delegation, um, at F.E. Warren called Crimson Rider, and that's where we showcased our response for this capability and our convoy procedures for transporting a nuke warhead." (Ex 21:2) The overall goal of the two-day exercise and associated training demonstrations was to showcase Ministry of Defense (MOD) readiness to execute nuclear convoy operations and security of weapons in transport. The exercise was conducted at the Abramovo Counter-Terrorism Training Center in Sergeiv Posad, Russia. (Ex 7:2)

b6
b7c

The 12th Main Directorate, Glavnoye Upravleniye Ministerstvo Oborony (GUMO)⁵ was the MOD lead for the exercise. The 12th GUMO is responsible for the entire nuclear warhead inventory within Russia to include security, transportation, and accountability. The senior RF MOD members were General Major Federov (one star equivalent, who participated on Day 2) and Colonel Motasov (General Major-select, who participated both days). These senior officers led the majority of the discussions. (Ex 7:2)

Exercise objectives

- US/RF Goal: Showcase convoy readiness and transportation security
- July 16 (Day 1): Highlight training provided to escort personnel, such as drivers, guard units, explosive experts and medical personnel
- July 17 (Day 2): Execute escort personnel duties, response to enemy aggression, coordination with ground forces, air forces and local authorities and mitigating the threat (Ex 6:10)

The US Delegation was led by Major General Carey and consisted of representatives from the Joint Staff J3, OASD for Nuclear Matters, OPNAV N97G (Nuclear Weapons Safety/Security & Policy), AFGSC/A7S (Nuclear Weapons Security), and the Department of Energy/NNSA NA-251. Based on the US Joint Staff and RF General Staff Work Plan, the DoD delegation was limited to six personnel. DTRA as the lead agency was tasked to assemble a community of nuclear security experts to serve as observers to the exercise. The MOD also invited a member of the Department of Energy (NNSA NA-251) to observe the exercise. (Ex 7:3)

⁵ The best US government source document found by the IO to identify the acronym GUMO was from <http://www.usafa.edu/df/inss/OCP/ocp10.pdf>

The US Delegation consisted of the following individuals:

- Maj Gen Michael J. Carey, USAF, AFGSC, 20 AF/CC
- Lt Col [REDACTED]
- LTC [REDACTED]
- Mr. [REDACTED]
- Mr. [REDACTED]
- Ms. [REDACTED]
- Mr. [REDACTED]
- Mr. [REDACTED], was an invited guest and attended the briefings on the 16 and 17 Jul 13.

b6
b7c

According to Mr. [REDACTED], Maj Gen Carey was briefed at the Pentagon prior to his departure regarding who the 12th GUMO was, what the expectations were, Crimson Rider 11 lessons learned, and what capabilities were shown to the RF during Crimson Rider 11. (Ex 21:7)

Maj Gen Carey

In Jun 12, Maj Gen Carey was assigned as the 20 AF/CC and dual-hatted as Commander, Task Force (TF) 214, US Strategic Command (STRATCOM), F. E. Warren AFB, WY. Maj Gen Carey is responsible for the nation's intercontinental ballistic missile (ICBM) force, which is organized in three operational wings with more than 9,600 people. (Ex 3:1-3, Ex 4)

Method of investigation

The IO determined that a chronological, event by event, methodology of presenting the facts would provide the greatest level of understanding of Maj Gen Carey's actions during the temporary duty (TDY). The IO presented a significant amount of testimony in this document to emphasize the words used by the witnesses and Maj Gen Carey to present a clearer understanding of whether evidence supported the allegation against Maj Gen Carey.

IV. CHRONOLOGY

DATE	EVENT
13 Jul 13	Maj Gen Carey departs from Denver, weather caused significant flight delays. (Ex 15:8)
14 Jul 13	Maj Gen Carey arrived at Dulles Airport around 0300 hours (hrs). (Ex 15:8)
14 Jul 13	US delegation show time at Dulles Airport approximately 1400 hrs. (Ex 21:8)
15 Jul 13	US delegation arrived in Moscow approximately 1700 hrs. (Ex 21:12)
16 Jul 13	First day of exercise in Sergeiv Posad. (Ex 5:9)

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

17 Jul 13	Final day of exercise in Sergeiv Posad. (Ex 5:11)
18 Jul 13	Depart for return to the US. (Ex 21:38)

Chronology of activities of interest in this investigation⁶

DATE	EVENT
14 Jul 13	Travel to Moscow: Maj Gen Carey stated he had wine on the way to Zurich. (Ex15:9) Witness stated Maj Gen Carey had alcohol at the airport in Zurich. (Ex 20:7)
15 Jul 13	Marriott: The team had drinks in executive lounge after arriving at Marriott and drinks in the Marriott lobby area. (Ex 22:12-13, Ex 17:5-6) Witness stated Maj Gen Carey was talking about the importance of his position and that his group had the worst morale and that the leadership wasn't supporting him. (Ex 20:8) Maj Gen Carey and Mr. ██████ left the Marriott around midnight to go the Ritz. (Ex 21:13) Ritz Carlton: Maj Gen Carey and Mr. ██████ met two foreign national women at the Ritz Carlton. ⁷ (Ex 21:28) Returned to the Marriott hotel between 2:30 and 5 AM. (Ex 21:15, Ex 20:9)
16 Jul 13	Departure from Marriot hotel to go to Sergeiv Posad: Maj Gen Carey was 45 minutes late for the departure time. (Ex 20:9) Initial briefing by the RF: Maj Gen Carey's behavior perceived by at least some of the US delegation as rude. (Ex 20:11, Ex 17:13) Lunch banquet: RF not pushing alcohol. (Ex 22:24) Approximately nine toasts during the banquet. (Ex 16:16) Maj Gen Carey made comments regarding Syria and Mr. Eric Snowden that were not well received by the RF. (Ex 22:25-26) Maj Gen Carey made comments regarding lovely ladies that were concerning to some members of the delegation. (Ex 16:16) Witness stated that that Maj Gen Carey drank more than most of the other participants. (Ex 17:16, Ex 20:12) Ms. ██████ stated that Maj Gen Carey announced he had met two hot women the night before. (Ex 20:12) Monastery: Maj Gen Carey was slurring his speech and continually interrupted the tour guide. (Ex 20:13) Maj Gen Carey also left the group to go with another tour guide. (Ex 16:17, Ex 17:19) Red Square: Maj Gen Carey was lagging behind on the walk to Red Square. (Ex

b6
b7c

⁶ These events are discussed in greater detail within the analysis section of this document.

⁷ Maj Gen Carey stated he had concerns regarding the two women he and Mr. ██████ met at the Ritz Carlton the first night. (Ex 15:14-15) Upon his return, Maj Gen Carey gave the two women's business cards to the Office of Special Investigation (OSI). (Ex 15:14) When asked why he was concerned about the two women, Maj Gen Carey stated, "Well, it just seemed kind of peculiar that we saw them one night and then saw them again later while we were there and for people who are in business to be kinda conveniently in the same place where we're at, it seemed odd to me. Same thing with the tobacco store lady." (Ex 15:14)

	<p>16:19) Other members had to keep checking on him. (Ex 18:14, Ex 21:40) Maj Gen Carey didn't want to walk around Red Square with the group. (Ex 17:25) Maj Gen Carey was described as pouting and sulking about the day's events. (Ex 20:14-15)</p> <p>La Cantina (dinner): Maj Gen Carey was drinking alcohol and kept trying to get the band to let him play with them. (Ex 21:26) He left the US group and sat with the two women from the Ritz Carlton he had met the night before. (Ex 15:41) Maj Gen Carey also danced with one of the women from the night before. (Ex 22:39)</p> <p>Post La Cantina: Maj Gen Carey, two US delegation members and the two women went to several places for drinks after leaving the La Cantina. (Ex 22:38, Ex 21:28,30) Maj Gen Carey arrived at his hotel approximately 3 AM. (Ex 22:38)</p>
17 Jul 13	<p>Departure from Marriott hotel to go to Sergeiv Posad: 15 minutes late because of Maj Gen Carey despite the RF request to be on time. (Ex 21:32)</p> <p>Initial briefings: Maj Gen Carey's behavior again described as rude by interrupting the speakers and correcting the Russian translator. (Ex 20:19) Used an American TV ad "Can you hear me now" to make a point but it was not received well. (Ex 16:25-26)</p> <p>Lunch banquet: RF not pushing alcohol. (Ex 22:53) Approximately 25 toasts were given during the banquet. (Ex 22:54) Interrupted RF toasts with commentary. (Ex 20:19-20)</p> <p>Return to the Marriott: Maj Gen Carey had drinks in the lobby of the Marriot until approximately 4 AM with LTC [REDACTED] and "Cigar Shop Lady."⁸ (Ex 17:39)</p>
18 Jul 13	Return to the US.

b6
b7c

V. ALLEGATION, FINDINGS, STANDARDS, ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSION

ALLEGATION. That Major General Michael J. Carey engaged in inappropriate behavior during a temporary duty assignment from 14 to 18 Jul 13, in violation of Article 133, Uniform Code of Military Justice, Conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman.⁹

⁸ Maj Gen Carey bought cigars from the cigar shop within the Marriott on two of his three nights in Moscow. (Ex 21:12, 37) Maj Gen Carey stated that he had concerns regarding the lady selling cigars and also turned in her business card to the OSI upon his return. Maj Gen Carey stated, "And I advised one of the officers [OSI] that you need to watch out for that because that's just like our training says, you know, people are trolling for information. And a tobacco store lady talking about physics in the wee hours of the morning doesn't make a whole lot of sense to me. Most, most, uh, um, store vendors are home trying to sleep for the next day." (Ex 15:15)

⁹ The allegation was originally drafted to reflect that Maj Gen Carey *exhibited* inappropriate behavior while TDY. The IO determined that the more appropriate language was that Maj Gen Carey *engaged in* inappropriate behavior while TDY, so the allegation was amended to reflect this change. The IO did not notify Maj Gen Carey of this change as it was not substantive and the IO investigated the same conduct, under the same standard, as originally alleged.

STANDARDS.

Uniform Code of Military Justice, Article 133--Conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman:

a. Text.

"Any commissioned officer, cadet, or midshipman who is convicted of conduct unbecoming an officer and a gentleman shall be punished as a court-martial may direct."

b. Elements.

- (1) That the accused did or omitted to do certain acts; and
- (2) That, under the circumstances, these acts or omissions constituted conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman.

c. Explanation.

- (1) Gentleman. As used in this article, "gentleman" includes both male and female commissioned officers, cadets, and midshipmen.
- (2) Nature of offense. Conduct violative of this article is action or behavior in an official capacity which, in dishonoring or disgracing the person as an officer, seriously compromises the officer's character as a gentleman, or action or behavior in an unofficial or private capacity which, in dishonoring or disgracing the officer personally, seriously compromises the person's standing as an officer. There are certain moral attributes common to the ideal officer and the perfect gentleman, a lack of which is indicated by acts of dishonesty, unfair dealing, indecency, indecorum, lawlessness, injustice, or cruelty. Not everyone is or can be expected to meet unrealistically high moral standards, but there is a limit of tolerance based on customs of the service and military necessity below which the personal standards of an officer, cadet, or midshipman cannot fall without seriously compromising the person's standing as an officer, cadet, or midshipman or the person's character as a gentleman. This article prohibits conduct by a commissioned officer, cadet, or midshipman which, taking all the circumstances into consideration, is thus compromising. This article includes acts made punishable by any other article, provided these acts amount to conduct unbecoming an officer and a gentleman. Thus, a commissioned officer who steals property violates both this article and Article 121. Whenever the offense charged is the same as a specific offense set forth in this Manual, the elements of proof are the same as those set forth in the paragraph which treats that specific offense, with the additional requirement that the act or omission constitutes conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman.
- (3) Examples of offenses. Instances of violation of this article include knowingly making a false official statement; dishonorable failure to pay a debt; cheating on an exam; opening and reading a letter of another without authority; using insulting or defamatory language to another officer in that officer's presence or about that officer to other military persons; being drunk and disorderly in a public place; public association with

known prostitutes; committing or attempting to commit a crime involving moral turpitude; and failing without good cause to support the officer's family. (Ex 9:1)

AFI 90-301, *Inspector General Complaints Resolution*, 23 Aug 11, Incorporating Change 1, 6 Jun 12.

Inappropriate Conduct—Action a reasonable person would consider likely to erode confidence in the integrity of the Air Force, but which does not violate an identifiable directive, instruction, policy, regulation, rule, statute, or other standard applicable to the Air Force. (Ex 10:2)

ANALYSIS.

Because of the perceived subjectivity when determining if Maj Gen Carey's conduct was unbecoming of an officer and a gentleman, a holistic view of his actions during the TDY is needed. As such, this document provides a significant amount of testimony to provide a balanced and definable source to determination if wrongdoing by Maj Gen Carey occurred.

The IO reviewed witness testimony regarding Maj Gen Carey's actions from the time the team arrived at Dulles Airport on 14 Jul 13, until the team's departure from Moscow on the morning of 18 Jul 13. Even though no one individual had complete knowledge regarding all of Maj Gen Carey's actions or statements, the IO was able to assemble credible testimony to provide a reasonable account of Maj Gen Carey's activities during this TDY. Maj Gen Carey's account of events varied greatly at times from those of the other US members on the trip. The IO reviewed all of testimony associated with the investigation and determined that Maj Gen Carey was generally less credible than the other witnesses. Additionally, the IO was cognizant of the fact that Mr. [REDACTED] and Mr. [REDACTED] are employed by [REDACTED], and had a vested interest in making sure the outcome of this exercise was a success. (Ex 21:28)

b6
b7c

Suspect interview

The IO's interview with Maj Gen Carey was coordinated with Maj Gen Carey and Maj [REDACTED] (defense council for Maj Gen Carey) and was accomplished in person on 4 Sep 13 in the SAF/IGS conference room, Pentagon, Washington DC. Both Maj Gen Carey and his legal counsel were briefed that the interview would take between 2 to 3 hours. The questions presented by the IO to Maj Gen Carey referenced events, both generic and specific, regarding his activities during the TDY.

The interview began at 1300. Maj Gen Carey was initially friendly and engaging; however, as the interview progressed Maj Gen Carey appeared to become agitated with some lines of questioning, became visibly flush, and at times gave curt responses. On occasion, Maj

Gen Carey exercised his right not to incriminate himself and declined to answer certain questions.

Maj Gen Carey appeared flippant in his attitude towards the interview and did not expect the interview to last more than an hour. (Ex15:29) Although Maj Gen Carey was informed ahead of time that the interview could possibly take 3 hours, he scheduled an appointment at 1400 and the interview was temporarily suspended while Maj Gen Cary called to cancel his appointment. (Ex 15:29-30) Maj Gen Carey was unable to recall significant events from less than two months earlier, after being informed of the investigation only 11 days after the TDY, and often commingled blocks of time during the TDY, as will be discussed later in the analysis. The IO was unable to determine whether Maj Gen Carey was not being truthful or was actually unable to recall these events. However, the IO did note that at times, Maj Gen Carey would have moments of clarity and provide minute facts of trivial data such as meeting a US delegation member once in 1998 or describing a food item in detail during one of the RF banquets.¹⁰

Chronology of events:

Travel on 13/14/15 Jul 13

According to Maj Gen Carey, he began the trip to Moscow by driving to Denver, Colorado and taking a flight to Dulles Airport, Virginia on 13 Jul 13. However, because of weather delays, he did not arrive at Dulles until approximately 0300 hrs on 14 Jul 13, the same day as the flight to Moscow. (Ex 15:8)

Maj Gen Carey stated he checked into his hotel after arriving that morning, he went to bed, then met some friends for lunch and then went back to the airport terminal to check in for the flight to Moscow.¹¹ (Ex 15:8) Maj Gen Carey stated his flight from Dulles to the first transfer point (Zurich) was uneventful and normal for him. He stated that he ate on the flight, probably drank a glass or two of wine, and did not sleep well on the flight. (Ex 15:9)

b6
b7c

During the layover at Zurich, witnesses stated that Maj Gen Carey had purchased at least one beer in the main waiting area.¹² Ms. ██████ stated that Maj Gen Carey was visibly agitated about the long delay at Zurich, he appeared drunk and, in the public area, talked loudly about the importance of his position as commander of the only operational nuclear force in the world and that he saves the world from war every day. (Ex 20:7) Mr. ██████ stated that he and Maj Gen

¹⁰ Maj Gen Carey recalled meeting Mr. ██████ in 1998 or 1999 at a previous exercise. (Ex 15:10) Maj Gen Carey also recalled a food item but little else at one of the banquets, stating "I particularly liked, had a nice, uh, almost like a tortilla kind of cone with a caviar in it and a sprig of, um, uh, like dill or something like that. It was delicious." (Ex 15:51)

¹¹ A rendezvous time of 1400hrs at the United counter at Dulles was set up by Mr. ██████. (Ex 21:8).

¹² Ms. ██████ (Ex 20:7), Mr. ██████ (Ex 22:7), Lt Col ██████ (Ex 16:17)

Carey also went to the Swiss Air business class lounge for roughly forty five minutes where he remembered Maj Gen Carey “probably” had another beer. (Ex 22:7-8) Lt Col ██████ stated that Maj Gen Carey looked exhausted. (Ex 16:7)

When asked if he recalled consuming any alcoholic beverages, talking loudly about his position, or going to the executive lounge during the Zurich layover, Maj Gen Carey initially stated that he did not recall having any alcohol, talking loudly, nor did he remember going to the executive lounge. (Ex 15:9-10) In referencing the Swiss Air lounge, Maj Gen Carey stated, “In Zurich? No. I don’t remember going to an executive lounge ever” and “I don’t have access.” (Ex 15:9-10) Upon further prompting by the IO, Maj Gen Carey did recall going to the executive lounge and the conversation that he and Mr. ██████ had about their meeting in 1998 or 1999 when Mr. ██████ visited F.E. Warren. (Ex 15:10) Maj Gen Carey maintained that he did not recall consuming any alcohol in Zurich and that his follow-on flight to Moscow was uneventful. (Ex 15:10)

Marriott the night of the 15th

Upon the US delegation’s arrival in Moscow and after checking into the Marriott Aurora, the team met in the executive lounge for what many indicated as somewhat of a team meeting for the following day’s events as well as an opportunity to unwind.¹³ (Ex 16:10) Delegation members stated that Maj Gen Carey was present in the Marriott executive lounge and, while there, consumed several beers. (Ex 22:12-13, Ex 17:5-6) Ms. ██████ stated:

b6
b7c

And again, he started in on the very loud discussions about being in charge of the only operationally deployed force and saving the world, much of what he was saying before at the airport in Zurich and then he also started telling the story about how he has the worst morale of any airmen in the Air Force. They’ve done a study and saw that his... you know, the missile bases or everyone is really unhappy and he is trying to make it better and leadership is not helping out and not listening to him and again, not classified but not really something I was comfortable with you know, being part of in a Russian hotel in the middle of Moscow. (Ex 20:8)

Additionally, while in the executive lounge at the Marriott Aurora, Mr. ██████, in his discussion with Maj Gen Carey, stated, “I mentioned [the rooftop bar at the Ritz Carlton], I wanted to do it the next day, and then he [Maj Gen Carey] said let’s do it tonight. And, uh, so I agreed.” (Ex 21:12)

¹³ The executive lounge is for guests with special privileges because of their frequent stays. Mr. ██████ had executive privileges and his room key was coded with access to the lounge floor prior to his arrival. Mr. ██████ was able to bring guests to the lounge and after the 15th he had the executive lounge access granted to the other delegation member’s room keys. (Ex 22:11-12)

Maj Gen Carey remembered having conversations in the lobby of the hotel but did not remember going to the Marriott executive lounge for drinks.¹⁴ Additionally when asked if he remembered making comments regarding the morale in his units and the lack of support he received from his leadership, he stated (after a lengthy pause):

Um, so depending on who I'm talking to, I would maybe target some comments, but I don't remember saying that my command's not supporting me, no. (Ex 15:12)

...

No. I just got done briefing the Chief of Staff that, today, that morale is, is actually, is solid in 20th Air Force, and because of what the command and the Headquarters is doing to get things done. (Ex 15:12)

According to Mr. [REDACTED], after leaving the Marriott executive lounge, he and Maj Gen Carey went to the Marriott's lobby area and bought a cigar and had another beer. (Ex 21:12) Maj Gen Carey stated that Mr. [REDACTED] was the one that suggested that they go the Ritz Carlton that night, "Yeah, [REDACTED] suggested that we go to look at the, go to the top floor of the [Ritz Carlton] hotel and look over the city of Moscow. And so we did that."¹⁵ (Ex 15:13) According to Mr. [REDACTED], around midnight, he and Maj Gen Carey left the Marriott lobby bar area and went to the Ritz Carlton. (Ex 21:13)

b6
b7c

Ritz Carton on the night of the 15th

According to Mr. [REDACTED], the Ritz Carlton was approximately a five minute walk from the Marriott. (Ex 21:15) While at the Ritz Carlton, Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he and Maj Gen Carey were drinking casually and had a drink every hour or hour and a half and they stayed at the Ritz Carton rooftop bar for approximately two hours. (Ex 21:13) Mr. [REDACTED] stated that they met two women who worked for an executive travel service and they were from the United Kingdom (UK).¹⁶
¹⁷(Ex 21:14) Mr. [REDACTED] stated that after the Ritz Carlton lounge closed, Mr. [REDACTED], Maj Gen Carey and the two women walked to the La Cantina restaurant/bar but it was closed. (Ex 21:14-15) Mr. [REDACTED] then mentioned to the women that he and Maj Gen Carey might go to listen to the band at the La Cantina, Mr. [REDACTED] stated:

¹⁴ Maj Gen Carey stated, "I, I, frankly I don't recall going to the [Marriott executive lounge]... we may have. I don't recall. I do know that we got together. I remember talking in the lobby and saying that we're gonna get together and talk about what we're gonna do." (Ex 15:11)

¹⁵In the analysis of the witnesses' testimony, the IO began to identify areas where Mr. [REDACTED] and Maj Gen Carey's recollection of events, namely contact with the women, began to differ.

¹⁶ Ms. [REDACTED] stated, "From what [REDACTED] said, one was English and one was Russian. Or he didn't know if the woman was Russian but he thought she was Russian or former Soviet Republic maybe." (Ex 20:15)

¹⁷ Mr. [REDACTED] also believed he told the women that he and Maj Gen Carey were in the security business. (Ex 21:28)

█████: I would say plans [for the following night] is a, in my opinion a loose term, because it was more like oh, what a shame [La Cantina was closed], maybe next time, you know, that kind of thing. Oh, what a shame, it's closed, and those two particular people had mentioned that they were going to the, um, Bolshoi, the big ballet company there, so...

IO: The two women?

█████: Yes.

IO: Okay, so what did y'all do after that? You couldn't get in [La Cantina]?

█████: Yeah, went back to the hotel. (Ex 21:15)

Maj Gen Carey did not initially seem overly concerned with the company of the women or that the women were told that he and Mr. █████ may be at the La Cantina the following night. Maj Gen Carey stated:

IO: Okay. Alright. Did you uh, did you make plans with the two folks that you met to meet up with them later?

Carey: █████ said that we would go to a place called the Cantina or something like that and maybe they could be there.

IO: Okay. So █████ talked to them about that?

Carey: Yeah, he seemed to be pretty... he's the guy who's been around, uh, uh, Moscow, so he's a comfortable guy, so he was, um, in my mind, um, he knew what was going on or knew what we should be doing or where we would go because I had never been in that part of Russia before, that part of Moscow....

IO: So, these were the two women, um, you mentioned turning in business cards, were these the cards of these two women?

Carey: Mm-hmm. [Affirmative connotation]

IO: Okay and these are the same women that █████ told you, told them, that y'all could meet up with them later?

Carey: Yeah, he said tomorrow night when I'm there at this place, why don't you, or whatever, why don't you join up with us, or if you're there we'll see you or something. I don't know how direct it was, but it was something along those lines.

IO: Did that cause you any concern that he did that?

b6
b7c

Carey: No.

IO: So, what did that...

Carey: I thought he was just being congenial. (Ex 15:16)

Maj Gen Carey did not recall trying to go to the La Cantina that night. (Ex 15:15-16) Maj Gen Carey recalled:

Carey: What did I tell them [two women they met at the Ritz Carlton]? I don't recall the story that I told them. I mean I probably told them that I was in the Air Force.

IO: Mm-hmm. Okay. Um, did, uh, [REDACTED], what did he refer to you as while they were there? General? Sir? Anything?

Carey: I, you know, I should recall, but I don't. I have no, whatever it was seemed normal to me.

IO: Okay.

Carey: He didn't call me Mike. (Ex 15:15)

b6
b7c

When they discovered that the La Cantina was closed, Mr. [REDACTED] and Maj Gen Carey left in a taxi back to the Marriott because it was late and raining. (Ex 21:15) Additionally, the two women did show up the following night at the La Cantina as will be discussed later in the document. (Ex 15:41)

Departure from the Marriot the morning of the 16th

The morning of 16 Jul 13, departure time for the US delegation as identified by witness testimony was 0730hrs. (Ex 17:7, Ex 22:14) At 0730hrs, the Russian delegation scheduled to transport the US team arrived and the only two members not present in the lobby were Mr. [REDACTED] and Maj Gen Carey. (Ex 16:11) Mr. [REDACTED] stated, "So the next thing I know it's like 7:30 and we're supposed to be downstairs at 7:30 to meet, um, our drivers, and meet the MOD, and uh, so I'm, like, panicking..." (Ex 21:16) Ms. [REDACTED] testified that the Russians were visibly agitated that not all participants were ready to depart on time and one Russian delegation member asked her if they were sure Maj Gen Carey was still in the hotel. (Ex 20:9) Mr. [REDACTED] quoted the senior Russian member who was there to transport the US delegation to Sergeiv Posad, "you know, we're running a little late, we have, you know, trainees waiting, uh, at the facility for the demonstration so we'd like to get going as soon as we can." (Ex 19:6) Mr. [REDACTED] called Mr. [REDACTED] room to check on him. (Ex 22:15) Shortly thereafter, Mr. [REDACTED] arrived at the lobby in what Ms. [REDACTED] described as the clothes he wore the day before. (Ex 20:9) Mr. [REDACTED] contacted Maj Gen Carey to make sure he was up. Answering his phone, Maj Gen Carey asked if 0815hrs

13

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

would be ok for their departure and Mr. ██████ said yes. (Ex 21:16-17) At 0815hrs, Maj Gen Carey arrived in the lobby. LTC ██████ stated that Maj Gen Carey looked tired and his eyes were bloodshot. (Ex 17:8) The IO asked if the Russian delegation, who were there to transport the US delegation, said anything regarding Maj Gen Carey's tardiness. Mr. ██████ commented, "I think when you're dealing with a two-star General, that, that [being late] doesn't surprise anybody...." (Ex 22:15)

In his interview, Maj Gen Carey identified that he was late, that he had three to four hours of sleep that night, and stated he was out of sorts on his body clock and that typically he would have relied on his exec to make sure he was where he needed to be. (Ex 15:17-19)

I had a wake-up call from ██████. So my typical practice is to have my aide call me 45 minutes prior to show time. I wasn't allowed to take my aide, so my normal routine was absolutely not my normal routine on top of the jet lag on top of everything else. (Ex 15:17)

The IO found it odd that Maj Gen Carey, knowing his aide was not present, did not make arrangements for a wake-up call that would have ensured he was up and ready for his 0730hrs departure.

It was an approximately one hour and 45 minute drive from the hotel to Sergeiv Posad. (Ex 17:8) Delegation members stated that Maj Gen Carey slept some of the way to the base. (Ex 16:13, Ex 17:9)

b6
b7c

Initial briefing at Sergeiv Posad by the MOD on the 16th

The meeting started a bit late, however there was time built into the schedule for pleasantries prior to the start of the briefing. (Ex 19:8) Two interpreters, Mr. ██████ and a RF female, were present providing the translation for the briefings. (Ex 15:23) Interchanges between the US and RF delegations would take time as the interpreters translated word or ideas to or from the other party. (Ex 16:14) Although testimony will show that Maj Gen Carey had difficulty understanding the translator and US delegation members perceived that he told Mr. ██████ to take over both sides of the translation, Maj Gen Carey stated that he did not have any issues with the RF translator:

Carey: No, she [RF translator] was fine as far as I could tell.

IO: Okay. So, nothing as far as her ability to, uh, translate, uh, the Russian for you or anything like that?

Carey: So, she didn't translate Russian for me. She translated English for the, for the Colonel. And then my civilian DTRA interpreter translated for me, so, I, I couldn't tell

14

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

you how good she was as a translator because I don't know what he said in English. I just believed whatever she said to be true. (Ex 15:23)

Additionally, Maj Gen Carey also stated that, "so throughout the day, I can read, they'll put slides up and the word ponimayu means I understand and I would say ponimayu, ponimayu probably to the point where they would say we get you understand it let's go on with the briefing." (Ex 15:21)

Ms. [REDACTED] stated that Maj Gen Carey's continuous interruptions were noticeably rude:

I guess he [Maj Gen Carey] understands or speaks some Russian, I'm not sure how much, but uh, I don't know if he was interrupting because he understood enough of the Russian where he didn't feel like he needed the translators to finish translating but of course, the rest of us that don't speak Russian um, it was just... I thought it was very rude especially because he just jumped right in as they were speaking. (Ex 20:9)

During the initial briefings on 16 Jul 13, many US delegation members provided testimony contrary to Maj Gen Carey's recollection the morning briefing. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that Maj Gen Carey was having issues understanding the RF translator, "he was asking her to repeat herself. He was saying excuse me, could you please repeat yourself. And when he did that a few times, you understand he's having trouble understanding her...." (Ex 22:19)

LTC [REDACTED] added:

When the Russians would respond or ask a question, their interpreter would speak and interpret that. That's generally how it works when there are two interpreters. In this particular case, the... a lot of what their interpreters were saying was somewhat difficult to understand so at one point, I believe, Gen Carey asked our interpreter to kind of take over at which point he did for that first day and basically kind of ran the whole rest of the meeting. Our interpreter for the... their interpreter occasionally would chime in but ours kind of took over for the most part. (Ex 17:12)

b6
b7c

It appeared to Ms. [REDACTED], and reinforced by statements made to her by Mr. [REDACTED], that Mr. [REDACTED] was requested to take over the translation by Maj Gen Carey. Ms. [REDACTED] presented her opinion of the reaction of the RF delegation to this change:¹⁸

I thought they [RF] were insulted... they were unhappy. Clearly, she [RF linguist] was unhappy because I think she was embarrassed and insulted by the fact that we just pretty much took over and you know, they never said anything but I could see the agitation on

¹⁸ Mr. [REDACTED] statement to the IO differed slightly from what Ms. [REDACTED] stated. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that Maj Gen Carey did not specifically ask him to take over, Mr. [REDACTED] simply felt the need to take over because the RF translator was having issues. (Ex 22:19) However, the IO concluded that Ms. [REDACTED] testimony appears to be consistent, credible and plausible.

her face that she was not pleased. And I know [REDACTED] felt bad because he said afterwards like he didn't feel that he had an option otherwise but he didn't want to insult her because he felt she was doing a fairly good job. (Ex 20:11)

b6
b7c

LTC [REDACTED] also noticed the change in the translator usage and stated the following:

[A] lot of what their interpreters were saying was somewhat difficult to understand so at one point, I believe, Gen Carey asked our interpreter to kind of take over at which point he did for that first day and basically kind of ran the whole rest of the meeting. Our interpreter for the... their interpreter occasionally would chime in but ours kind of took over for the most part. (Ex 17:12)

...

Uh, I honestly didn't even realize it happened until I heard our interpreter talking about it so I didn't hear the General ask it, I just assumed that he did so... but I did notice at some point our interpreter was doing most of the talking. Um, so, I mean, when I kind of did realize that, it didn't seem to me that the Russians were too taken aback by it but I do think that their interpreter was probably slighted by it. She probably felt a little taken aback by it. (Ex 17:13)

After the morning briefing concluded, the team went to the exercise training grounds where the RF provided a walk-through of what would be seen at the following day's live fire event. (Ex 5:9) With regard to his opinion of how the exercise went that morning, Maj Gen Carey stated:

Carey: Well, other than the fact that, like I articulated already, it's kind of sophomoric, showing me how to change a tire and how to tow a truck was a little underwhelming. Um, watching the combat skills and the first aid skills was, um, the first aid skills, watching the soldier pretend to put a bandage on somebody who's pretending to be hurt, um, prodding for land mines as a means to defeat IEDs I thought was more World War II style. So, so to see those types of activities, I'm going...

IO: Did you bring that up to the Russian Federation side of house, or did you just...?

Carey: No, just the American side.

IO: ... mostly internal to the US...

Carey: I mean for the Russians, for example, I said "Oh that looks great. That's really... How long they been together? It looks very well, you know, prepared." I was paying compliments to them.

IO: Okay.

Carey: Offsite, no. I was, no. When we got back to the hotel I was like you gotta be kidding me. This is an absolute waste of our time. So, and that I was not shy about. (Ex 15:24)

Prior to his departure for Russia, Maj Gen Carey received a 45 minute briefing on what to expect for the exercise. (Ex 15:3) The briefing given to Maj Gen Carey identified that the delegation members would see convoy readiness and transportation security. On 16 Jul 13 the RF would highlight training provided to escort personnel, such as drivers, guard units, explosive experts and medical personnel. On 17 Jul 13 the RF would demonstrate escort personnel duties, response to enemy aggression, coordination with ground forces, air forces and local authorities and mitigating the threat. (Ex 6:10) Maj Gen Carey identified that he expected to see a rolling Russian convoy, a demonstration on how they would respond to a convoy breaking down, and a convoy under attack. (Ex 15:3) Although he was briefed prior to departure, Maj Gen Carey still felt the event was a waste of time. (Ex 15:24)

Lunch banquet on exercise site on the 16th

During the interview, Maj Gen Carey could only recall "lunch" with water and coke lite as beverages. He conceded that, if others said there were toasts at lunch that first day, he would not refute it. He also stated that if there were toasts, he would have given toasts. (Ex 15:26-28) Maj Gen Carey also stated that he thought the group had alcohol on the way to the mission,¹⁹ "And um, I don't believe there was alcohol at lunch. I think alcohol was afterwards on the way to the, to the mission. At the end of the day." (Ex 15:25)

b6
b7c

As was indicated on the schedule, a lunch banquet was planned for the US delegation and their RF counterparts. Mr. ██████ recalled:

[T]he lunch is right next to the shooting area. They took us, oh, maybe, maybe 100 yards away, so, a little different site, we went to this, uh, they set up a tent for us, like a field tent, and, um, they cooked up a really nice meal for us, you know, a three course meal, um, a lot of hors d'oeuvres, so we sat down for this big lunch banquet behind this long table. (Ex 22:23)

Customary was the activity of toasts by the Russian delegation as well as reciprocal toasts by their US counterparts. (Ex 17:16) Lt Col ██████ stated that there were approximately nine toasts given at the first lunch banquet. (Ex 16:16) When asked if alcohol was being pushed to the delegation, Mr. ██████ stated, "No it was not being pushed at all, and the Russian side did not imbibe heavily; they, they had, you know, they, they were having, they were sipping their shot glasses." (Ex 22:24) Additionally, Mr. ██████ stated that, "one could even put a hand over

¹⁹ The IO presumed that Maj Gen Carey was talking about the visit to the monastery in Sergeiv Posad.

the shot glass and the servers would not refill it with vodka, and nothing was said....” (Ex 18:11)
Lt Col ██████ stated that even the RF delegation lead was drinking water during the event:

I think it was the drink to the military, then drink to the family members or women and drink to uh, the fallen... on those everybody usually drinks and then she said on the other ones like the Russian General across from us, he would pour water in his shot glass and he would say I'm in charge so I need to be sober today. (Ex 16:15)

Lt Col ██████ added:

You know, you did the traditional drinks and if you moderate yourself, you were good to go. But the General, it looked like it hit him pretty hard but he wasn't out of control or that but he did look like he had quite a few at the table there while we ate. (Ex 16:15)

According to Mr. ██████, during the lunch, Maj Gen Carey gave a toast to the group which included comments regarding Syria and Mr. Eric Snowden, which were not well received by the RF leadership. Mr. ██████ stated the following as to what he translated for Maj Gen Carey:

[Maj Gen Carey] said something like, uh, that we can, uh, we can, we, that is the Russian military; I think he was assuming that and the American military can find, um, a common dialogue despite certain differences which our nations might have such as Syria and/or maybe Snowden and I could sort of sense maybe the Russian side wasn't very happy about that, but they certainly didn't say anything, they just changed the topic, you know after the toast was raised they changed the topic and started discussing the weather, you know, in, in the wintertime, you know, they just changed the topic right away. They didn't, they didn't, they didn't delve into political, any political discussions. (Ex 22:25-26)

b6
b7c

According to Lt Col ██████, Maj Gen Carey also made the following comments:

██████: Uh, the Russians tended to... kind of a sexist thing but they kind of made comments to the ladies a little more. The Russians did and the General [Maj Gen Carey] kind of you know, jumped on the bandwagon a couple of times. Because the lady translator who was a Lieutenant, you know, she was kind of attractive and this so when they had the drinks to the ladies, it was like to the attractive ladies like you and type like that but that's kind of when I was like oh okay, yeah, I wouldn't have personally made those comments but it wasn't like uh, wasn't a sexual comment or it wasn't one of those type of dirty old men comments. It was more of a you know, kind of to the ladies and hey you know, you beautiful ladies and kind of like that you know, but after you have a couple drinks sometimes that's you know, it's not needed or whatever but I don't think it was over the top. The Russians kind of pushed that more. They led that into when they did the drink to the spouses or the women, the Russian General really made a big point of we drink to our family members and the ladies of the group and we always respect them

18

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

and so they were a little more on that than I think we would have in America and the General kind of jumped on the bandwagon a little bit there. I know for sure.

IO: Did ...

██████████: I kind of gave him the look and he kind of patted me on the back and said oh, it's all good ██████████. I said okay sir.

IO2: Okay.

██████████: Because I kind of said... I kind of gave him that look like hey sir, you know, it's all good here, let's keep it above board. But uh, you know, it wasn't like I had to scold him or anything. It just one of those guy things you do like come on sir, let's go... let's press on here. (Ex 16:16-17)

Ms. ██████████ testified:

Gen Carey was drinking and I would say proceeded to get inebriated again... he was again quite drunk.... [C]onversation was going on across the table and then at some point he announced that the reason he had been late [that] morning was that he had met two hot women at the bar the night before, which I didn't know at the time if it was a joke. I didn't know what the... if that was just something he said or if it was true or not. But the Russians at that point you know, made it very clear that we had to be on time the next day.... (Ex 20:12)

b6
b7c

LTC ██████████ stated that, "It didn't appear to me that anybody was intoxicated. Gen Carey did drink and he probably drank a little more than everybody else but I wouldn't say that he appeared to be intoxicated." (Ex 17:16) According to Mr. ██████████:

Uh, we must have been there about a couple of hours, and, uh, the General wanted to, uh, to stay I think and continue, um, his discussions and, and the Russians seem to be, wanting to finish the whole thing up, again they weren't really, um, talking a lot. They, they were polite and listening.... (Ex 22:26)

Given Maj Gen Carey's professed inability to recall much about the banquet the IO found it notable that Maj Gen Cary did not want to leave. The IO also asked Maj Gen Carey if he recalled mentioning Syria or Snowden during the banquet, and Maj Gen Carey said "No."²⁰ (Ex 15:32)

²⁰ Earlier in the interview, Maj Gen Carey mentioned Snowden when the IO asked questions regarding the overall context of the exercise. Maj Gen Carey stated, "This is also during the time of Snowden, so uh, you know, it wasn't necessarily a warm reception...." (Ex 15:6)

During this event, numerous US delegation members stated that the RF lead emphasized that the US delegation needed to be on time the following day because the events are choreographed. (Ex 16:12, Ex 18:15, Ex 22:27) Ms. ██████ recalled, "the Russians at that point you know, made it very clear that we had to be on time the next day." (Ex 20:12) Maj Gen Carey did not recall the Russians emphasizing the needed to be on time the next morning. (Ex 15:33-34)

When the US delegation departed the lunch to go to the monastery, witnesses stated that the Russians gave Maj Gen Carey an open bottle of vodka. (Ex 16:16, Ex 17:23, Ex 19:14)

Scheduled tour of the Sergeiv Posad, Lavra monastery on the 16th

A tour of a local monastery was set up for the US delegation. (Ex 22:28) The group, still in their uniform of the day, went to the Russian Orthodox Monastery which was about a ten minute van ride from where the group ate lunch.²¹ (Ex 20:13) Maj Gen Carey was initially toured with the US delegation group but did not stay with them the entire time. (Ex17:19) Ms. ██████ described Maj Gen Carey's behavior during his time with the US delegation at the monastery:

[H]he was slurring, he was interrupting her [tour guide]. At one point he tried to give her a fist bump. She had no idea what he was trying to do.²² It was again, very, very embarrassing. And then ultimately he decided that he wanted to be with the Russian group so he left us and went over to go with that group instead which I was pretty happy about because I was very embarrassed with his behavior with you know, the tour guide. In that case, everyone was in uniform. (Ex 20:13)

b6
b7c

Lt Col ██████ testified:

I think the General, he was showing the effects of the alcohol a little bit at that time because he kept interrupting her [tour guide] a lot and she just kind of gave him that look and then finally, he left our group and went over with the uh, Russians that came with us ...So the General kept interrupting her so it looked like he had a few too many drinks. It was all like, you know, he wasn't rude or anything, he just kept asking questions all the time while she was speaking and she got a little tired of him. And then he finally just drifted off after about fifteen minutes with us, he went with somebody else. Like a different tour group. I didn't see him again until the ride back home in the van. (Ex 16:17)

²¹ Mr. ██████ described the Russian Orthodox Monastery as being on the same level as the Vatican. (Ex 18:20)

²² Ms. ██████ was interviewed in person and gave a visual rendition of the fist-bump with a significant pause and awkward facial expressions representative of the tour guide's expression.

Maj Gen Carey stated he did not feel any effects of alcohol at the monastery. (Ex 15:34) Maj Gen Carey also stated that he had no recollection of trying to give the tour guide a fist-bump nor did he notice any agitation on the part of the tour guide. (Ex 15:34-35) In reference to why he didn't stay with the US group, Maj Gen Carey stated:

I didn't enjoy her presentation style and there was an English-speaking, uh, local national, if you will, uh, who was giving a tour to other elements of our entourage and I decided to join them. I enjoyed his presentation, um, um, better. His demeanor, the way he addressed things. (Ex 15:34)

Once the tour at the monastery was complete the group made the nearly two hour trip back to the Marriott Aurora and witnesses stated that Maj Gen Carey slept on the way to the hotel. (Ex 16:19, Ex 22:30) Once at the hotel, the group decided to meet back in the lobby after changing to go to Red Square and then to dinner. (Ex 17: 23) When the group initially arrived at the hotel, LTC █████ stated that Maj Gen Carey asked him to go to Maj Gen Carey's room to discuss issues he was having about the day's events. (Ex 17:23) The two of them had some of the vodka given to Maj Gen Carey after the banquet,²³ and Maj Gen Carey discussed his displeasure with the day's events and that he was contemplating not going the next day. LTC █████ listened and presented what he felt were Maj Gen Carey's options but gave no recommendation. (Ex 17:23-24) In his testimony, Maj Gen Carey confirmed having vodka with LTC █████. (Ex 15:37) Also in his testimony, Maj Gen Carey stated that he did not discuss *not* going back to the next day with anyone, "I, I wouldn't have said that. I don't recall saying that." (Ex 15:39) The IO found LTC █████ more credible.

b6
b7c

At this point in the interview, the IO noted Maj Gen Carey's demeanor began to change and his responses became curt, sometimes terse and he seemed agitated with the line of questioning.

Walk to Red Square the afternoon of the 16th

Most of the US delegation went to Red Square on the way to dinner on the night of 16 Jul 13, an approximately 15 minute walk.²⁴ (Ex 21:24) Maj Gen Carey was lagging behind the group on the way to Red Square and did not walk with the group around Red Square. (Ex 16:19-20) This was noticeable to the point that members, over this time period, felt compelled to stop and wait on Maj Gen Carey and even went back to check on him. (Ex 16:19-20, Ex 21:40) Ms. █████ used the words "pouting" and "sulking" in reference to Maj Gen Carey's demeanor. (Ex 20:14) Based on Mr. █████ description of Maj Gen Carey's behavior and the fact that he had

²³ Maj Gen Carey testified that they did not have much of the vodka "because there's still essentially a full bottle at my house." (Ex 15:37)

²⁴ Mr. █████ did not attend any of the US delegation social events. (Ex 19:17)

consumed alcohol at lunch (Ex 20:12) and at the hotel (Ex 17:23), it is plausible to the IO that Maj Gen Carey was intoxicated.

Ms. ██████ testified:

[I]t's maybe a ten minute walk to Red Square but he was going much slower and he was talking mostly to ██████ who was the ██████, uh, and the rest of us are kind of waiting and they finally catch up with us and uh, ██████ mentions to me that the General is very, very upset about that they didn't have a General from the Russian delegation since they knew he was coming. I think there was some fairness in that based on the dates. And then they only showed him how to change a tire. He kept going on about the tire. I can't believe they just showed us how to change a tire. This is such a waste. Why would they have us come here? I'm not going to go tomorrow. And basically was very... I want to say pouting and sulking about how the day had gone. He didn't feel like it had been useful or a good use of his time. So we eventually got to ... Red Square and he kind of stops in the corner of one of the buildings and he tells us to just go ahead. He is just going to sit here and think. And so the rest of us are like okay, well, I guess we will continue to walk around and one of the Joint Staff rep who had worked for him when Gen Carey was on Joint Staff tried to stay back with him just to make sure he was okay and then ended up catching up with us and said Gen Carey really wants to be alone. He doesn't want any... he is really upset. Okay. So we walk around Red Square and just kind of take pictures of St. Basil's and all of that and come back to meet him and he is still... I'm not going to go tomorrow. I'm really upset. Again, still really sulking but agrees to go to dinner with us... (Ex 20:14-15)

b6
b7c

Mr. ██████ stated:

██████: He was not totally coherent and [didn't have] all his faculties. While we were talking at the luncheon and then in the evening going towards Red Square, the time at Red Square and then the time that we were in the bar after we went around Red Square. He was not talking as you and I are talking right now. It was slurred.

IO: Okay. Content or things of that nature, was it, uh, appropriate for the conversation as far as you said that he was not coherent in faculties and things of that nature? I'm just trying to get a sense of, uh, if his words were slurred, was the thought process, those kinds of things?

██████: Well, when he was talking to me in Red Square ... he was going through his diatribe of why this was a waste of time, why wasn't he consulted [about going to Red Square], why were we there, so he was clearly upset. I don't know if he was, I do not, he may have been upset professionally, but it, it was obvious to me that I could not understand why he was upset as to the events of the day and the things that we had seen and, um, why he would think that what we were doing was a waste of time. And so I was looking at him as, as, what the hell are you doing here then, if that's you're, if that's your

22

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

opinion. This is important enough for the CNO [Chief of Naval Operations] to send me out here to do this, then why isn't it important to you? And so he was, I just, I did not approve of his behavior or his comments. (Ex 18:13)

...

He was, uh, the way that he was walking around it [Red Square] was obvious. When we got to Red Square and other places he had to hold on to the pillars, the columns that were around us. Um, it, it, it almost seemed like, um, like well, should I be, um, holding his hand or something. You know? And it was obvious that he did not want to walk around Red Square that afternoon, that evening because he couldn't. (Ex 18:12)

...

Now, when we left, when we were leaving Red Square and we were going towards this, this bar thing, um, we, we kept on looking behind us because the General was just standing there and going why isn't he coming with us? And so [REDACTED] would go back and move him up a little ways to keep him with us, I guess. (Ex 18:14)

Lt Col [REDACTED] stated:

[W]e started walking and he kept falling behind, walking real slow and we stopped two or three times for him to catch up and then... and so a couple of the guys went back and talked to him that knew him. The Army Lieutenant Colonel and him were stationed there [Pentagon] together so they talked for a while and then uh, [REDACTED] went back and talked to him. Apparently the General was upset that they didn't have a General Officer to meet him there that day and you know, he was just kind of being moody more than anything which you know, I don't know the guy so we didn't do anything. He fell behind a couple of times and we stopped and waited on him and then we finally got to [Red Square]... we told him what we wanted to do in Lenin Square or Red Square and uh, so he stayed at the edge of the Red Square and most of us walked around.... (Ex 16:19-20)

b6
b7c

LTC [REDACTED] stated:

[A]s we were walking up towards it [Red Square], and he had mentioned that he wanted to hang back and he didn't want to walk around... I said well sir, I'll stay back here with you. I've seen this before. I don't need to see it again unless you want to be alone and he said "no, go ahead, I want to be alone." So I went with the rest of the group and then I'm not sure what [he] and [REDACTED] discussed.... (Ex 17:25)

There was considerable, credible testimony that Maj Gen Carey continued to express his displeasure with the exercise events of the day and considered not going to the next day's events. The IO believed it important to point out that while Maj Gen Carey admitted he was displeased and commented on his displeasure to members of the delegation (Ex 15:39), he also stated he

would not have said he was contemplating not going back and that he didn't recall saying it. The IO was unable to tell if Maj Gen Carey was being untruthful or whether he honestly could not recall his statements.

Mr. [REDACTED] stated:

I was trying to keep a positive spin on it [Maj Gen Carey's issues with the day's events], and he told me he was second guessing going to the second day, that he, he may not go back because he felt, he felt a little offended by that, and, uh, you know, he was thinking about should I send a message back that if you're not going to meet with somebody equivalent, um, you know, why should I go back? And I told them, I said at this point we were at Red Square and I think 6:00 to 7:00, and I said well, I have a few hours to sell you on going back, and he said well, I hope you're a good salesman kind of thing. (Ex 21:22)

Mr. [REDACTED] additionally stated:

I think the Red Square thing kind of iced some people because he got a little distant, and you know, it's a senior leader and we don't know him, and that was that kind of thing. I just took it as that, um, I think some people may have been offended that he's like, no, you go walk up. It wasn't, um, you know, it wasn't an oh, go ahead walk up, I'll be waiting on you kind of thing, it was like no, you guys go kind of thing, so he was dismissive, but again I stayed back and talked to him, and that was coming from a place of he didn't really view that as a tourist attraction, and he was insulted by the Russians that day. (Ex 21:40)

b6
b7c

When giving his response to the questions regarding Red Square, Maj Gen Carey's answers were notably abrupt as opposed to the more open statements at the beginning of the interview. When asked if he toured Red Square with the group, Maj Gen Carey stated that he did not tour Red Square, because that would have been like touring Old Town Alexandria. (Ex 15:36) When asked to recall his actions going to and at Red Square, he stated:

IO: Okay. I guess whenever the group went there did, did you let them go ahead? Did you participate? Did you walk around with them? Uh, or were you off on your own during that time period?

Carey: I was not off on my own.

IO: So did you walk with the group as far as...?

Carey: Generally.

IO: Generally, okay. Did you lag behind them a good little bit, make any conversations with any of the folks?

24

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

Carey: I don't recall lagging behind or leading in any particular way that would be, um, curious.

IO: Okay.

IO2: Given the hours that you'd kept up to that point...

Carey: Mm-hmm. [Neutral connotation]

IO: ... do you recall how you felt physically?

Carey: Yeah, I was exhausted and when we got back to the hotel I took a nap.

IO: Before you all met to go out to dinner or after?

Carey: It was after.

IO2: Oh, okay. Af-, okay.

IO: Okay, and I guess during that timeframe whenever you're walking around with the group you'd mentioned before that you talked with the members of the group about your issues.

Carey: Mm-hmm. [Affirmative connotation]

IO: Did you do that there as well?

Carey: I think I commented on the fact that things were better the second day.

IO: Alright, I guess that still being the first day...

Carey: Oh, I'm sorry. Yeah, I would have commented on my frustrations of the first day, yes.

IO: Okay. And your concerns that you mentioned before as far as, uh,...

Carey: Lack of, lack of equitable rank, lack of sophistication, lack of transparency, lack of willingness to discuss, uh, the details of convoy operations which was the intent of the entire exercise.

IO: Did you mention that you may not go back the next day?

Carey: I, I wouldn't have said that. I don't recall saying that.²⁵ (Ex 15:38-39)

...

IO: So, any issues physically while you were there wondering, or walking around [Red Square]?

Carey: For me?

IO: Yes.

Carey: Like back and leg issues, or...?

IO: Well, that, or the alcohol or anything like that from the previous, uh, from the banquet, uh, because you had been to the monastery....

Carey: So, I've been training for a marathon, right, so I have shin splints, I have a lower back problem, I have a knee problem, and so walking at that particular point. The good news is I worked my way through the shin splints and the back issue and I now have a knee problem, but I'm still able to run significant distance with that. (Ex 15:40)

Dinner at the La Cantina restaurant on the 16th

b6
b7c

After the group finished walking around Red Square, they went to La Cantina for dinner.²⁶ Mr. █████ stated that Maj Gen Carey wanted to go to the La Cantina because, "the General really wanted to see this Beatles cover band, and you know, he wanted to try to hear live music, so we went to the Cantina place."²⁷ (Ex 21:24) Ms. █████ echoed that Maj Gen Carey wanted to go the La Cantina as well. Ms. █████ stated:

[Maj Gen Carey] insists that we go to this place called La Cantina, I think it was... it was a Mexican place. And I was kind of surprised... I wouldn't pick a Mexican place to go to in Russia but all right, if that's where he wants to go, we'll go there. So we show up and it turns out that I guess he somehow found out that this place had a band that plays and so he was really intent on singing with the band. He wanted to sing with the band. So we get in and it's extremely loud and the band is playing and he keeps asking the waitress and the bartender if he can sing with the band and they want nothing to do with this. And

²⁵ Numerous witnesses testified that Maj Gen Carey did state that he may not go the events the next day. (Ex 17:23, Ex 21:29, Ex 22:41)

²⁶ La Cantina is a Mexican restaurant near Red Square. (Ex 13:19)

²⁷ Maj Gen Carey stated that going to La Cantina was Mr. █████ idea. (Ex 15:40) Additionally, Maj Gen Carey also stated that Mr. █████ told the women they met at the Ritz Carlton the night of the 15th that they would be there the next day. Maj Gen Carey stated, "Yeah, he [Mr. █████] said tomorrow night when I'm there at this place, why don't you [two women from the Ritz Carlton], or whatever, why don't you join up with us, or if you're there we'll see you or something. I don't know how direct it was, but it was something along those lines." (Ex 15:16)

so he kept having our translator go up with him and ask them well can I sing with the band. (Ex 20:15)

While at La Cantina, witnesses stated that Maj Gen Carey had alcohol and kept trying to get the band to let him play with them. (Ex 16:20, Ex 17:25, Ex 21:26) According to Mr. [REDACTED], the band did not allow Maj Gen Carey to play with them. Mr. [REDACTED] stated:

[Maj Gen Carey] said, "go ask them if I could play the guitar." I said okay, I, I asked one of the band members and the guy said, no, I mean, you know, I can't do that. He goes if you really want to play this guitar go ahead and talk to the restaurant owner or the administrator or the manager, the restaurant manager and I didn't feel like doing that because I didn't want to go find the manager so I, told the General that basically, uh, you know, that he can't, he can't play the guitars and then he said, well try again, so I asked him to get up and we both stood next to this rock band and watched them up close. I was hoping to keep his interest in doing so and, uh, he, um, and then I said, listen if you really want to play the guitar maybe if you ask him, you know, um, maybe they'd listen to you more than would to me. And I'm not sure if he asked him or not because I, I, you know, I, I sat back down at the table, but he stood there for a while in front of this band and then he came back to the table a little later also, he came back later and sat down also, and said well, no they won't let me play. (Ex 22:32)

With regard to Maj Gen Carey's attempt to play with the band, Mr [REDACTED] added:

b6
b7c

I wasn't over for the conversations, but I do know I think it went from oh, this is kind of a cool thing that this random American wants to play with us to, all right, you know, kind of we told you no, guy. (Ex 21:26)

After the US delegation arrived at the La Cantina, the women that Maj Gen Carey and Mr. [REDACTED] met the previous night showed up. According Ms. [REDACTED], one of the women gave Maj Gen Carey a kiss on the cheek and Maj Gen Carey went to another table with them. (Ex 20:15) Ms. [REDACTED] recalled:

Ultimately he did not sing with them [the band] but he did keep asking and then so we order food and uh, you know a beer and everything and again, [Maj Gen Carey] is drinking again, and then these two women show up that come over to him and you know, give him a kiss on the cheek and say hi and you know, the light goes on in my head like okay, maybe he really did meet women the night before because he obviously knows these people and um, I don't know where he would know them from otherwise. And [REDACTED], the guy from [REDACTED], who had stayed with him the night before, you know, confirmed you know that yes, those were the people that they had met the night at the Ritz Carlton, I guess. And so they got a separate table and Gen Carey went over to sit down with them. (Ex 20:15)

Lt Col ██████ also recalled the two women's arrival and that Maj Gen Carey got up went to the table with the two women, "then two young ladies came in and said hello to everybody at the table... which surprised me. And then the General and the translator went over and sat with them." (Ex 16:20)

Mr. ██████ recalled Maj Gen Carey dancing with one of the women at La Cantina, "Yeah, I, I think he might have danced with one of them, um, yes, yeah, I think they did dance one time. It, it was a fast dance, I think, as far as I can remember." (Ex 22:39)

Ms. ██████ felt that this was putting the team at risk, "I realized that this was putting us all at risk, especially Russia and women and I just wanted nothing to do with it...." (Ex 20:16)

With the exception of Maj Gen Carey, Mr. ██████, and Mr. ██████, the group left La Cantina and went back to the hotel around 10:30 PM. (Ex 17:27-28, Ex 20:17, Ex 21:27, Ex 22:26) Mr. ██████ and Mr. ██████ stayed with Maj Gen Carey and the two women. Mr. ██████ testified that, "██████████ and ██████████ stayed at the pub [La Cantina] to accompany and babysit the General." (Ex 18:8) Mr. ██████ stated that they stayed at the La Cantina another hour or so after the other US delegation members left. (Ex 22:38) Additionally, Mr. ██████ added his comments regarding the discussion at the table with two women:

[Y]ou know, even them, they knew that Gen Carey was someone of importance, like he was kind of that boss role. They knew that. They knew we were Americans and they knew that we worked in the security business, and that's all they, that's all they knew. And so at that time, it had become known that the General kind of was, like, well, we may not have our meeting tomorrow, or however it came up. Somehow the table started discussing well, you gotta go, you're the, you know, you're the boss, you know, you gotta set the example, so it was kind of like a narrative, even at the table, at that point. (Ex 21:28-29)

b6
b7c

It was notable to the IO that a discussion was had, with two foreign national women, which could easily be deduced that Maj Gen Carey as someone of importance,²⁸ that Maj Gen Carey was probably in the Air Force²⁹, and that he was in Russia on official business.³⁰

Maj Gen Carey's comments were notably short and guarded during this portion of the interview. When asked for his comments from his time at the La Cantina, Maj Gen Carey did

²⁸ Mr. ██████ stated, "...they knew that Gen Carey was someone of importance, like he was kind of that boss role." (Ex 21:28-29)

²⁹ Maj Gen Carey stated, "What did I tell them? I don't recall the story that I told them. I mean I probably told them that I was in the Air Force." (Ex 15:15)

³⁰ Mr. ██████ stated, "They knew we were Americans and they knew that we worked in the security business, and that's all they, that's all they knew. And so at that time, it had become known that the General kind of was, like, well, we may not have our meeting tomorrow, or however it came up." (Ex 21:29)

not remember much detail or declined to answer. When asked about trying to play with the band, an incident about which was considerable testimony, Maj Gen Carey stated, "No, I don't recall that." (Ex 15:41).

Maj Gen Carey stated the following regarding the two women at La Cantina:

IO: Okay. Okay you mentioned earlier about meeting up, meeting up with, uh, the two individuals from the Ritz, uh, the Ritz-Carlton. Is this where the two ladies showed up?

Carey: Yes.

IO: Okay, can you tell me about that? How they came in, what their...?

Carey: No. I don't recall the details of the, of the, where they were, how they engaged us, other than the fact that they were there.

IO: Okay.

IO2: Were they there when you got there or did they get there later?

Carey: I don't recall.

IO: Okay. Um, whenever they were, they were there, did you go over there and sit with them?

Carey: We did visit, yes.

IO: How long did you all end up staying?

Carey: I don't, I couldn't tell you the timeframe.

IO: Okay.

IO2: Did the entire group stay there together for the evening or did some people leave and some stay?

Carey: Uh, I believe most of us stayed for the, for the longer portion of the time for dinner.

IO2: Did you sit with the ladies that you had met the night before?

Carey: I'd rather not answer that question.

IO2: Okay.

IO: Okay, did any of the other delegation sit with the ladies?

Carey: I'd rather not answer that question either.

IO: Okay. So, do you remember how long y'all ended up staying at the La Cantina?

Carey: I don't recall. (Ex 15:41-42)

La Cantina to the Marriott the night of the 16th

According to testimony, Maj Gen Carey, Mr. [REDACTED], Mr. [REDACTED], and the two women from the Ritz Carlton/La Cantina went to several other places after leaving the La Cantina and continued to drink alcoholic beverages. (Ex 21:29) Mr. [REDACTED] stated that when the five left La Cantina, they made several stops before arriving back to the Marriott Aurora:

[REDACTED], the General and I and the two ladies, and we said that we're going to have a cup of coffee or maybe a drink at some café on the way towards our hotel and then we would part ways there, and so that's, and then, my, my goal was to try to get the whole group close to our hotel so we could go to sleep, so I steered and [REDACTED] and I both steered, you know, sort of the General and, and these two individuals who came along with us to a café which is around the corner from our hotel, yeah, not too far away from our hotel, um, and it was sort of half way between the Marriott and the Ritz, uh, we sat down, uh, we had a drink and then, uh [REDACTED] left and then the ladies left and then the General and I went home. (Ex 22:38)

b6
b7c

Mr. [REDACTED] stated,

Uh, we stayed there [La Cantina] till about, uh, midnight. We talked to, uh, or whenever they close, 11:30 or 12:00 they close. And, uh, I can't remember the exact time and, uh, you know, again, my role in there was, I probably had a drink or two. I was not pulling another all-nighter. (Ex 21:28)

...

I'll say 2:00, 1:00 to 2:00. Because we left the other place [La Cantina], I'll say at midnight. By the time we walked around at a couple different places, again these, uh, we were with two people from the UK, and [REDACTED] knew of a pub there, a UK pub and we walked to that and it was closed, and we walked back. The first place we sat at we didn't really like, so there was a lot of transactional time to get to the next place. (Ex 21:30)

Mr. [REDACTED] recalled the conversation with Maj Gen Carey on their walk back to the hotel:

[REDACTED]: [T]hat was about 2:30 in the morning and that, that's when we were going back from the café and he, he's, I guess he was just philosophizing and, and he sort of thinking

out loud basically, and I, I, you know, I happened to be there and so I engaged him as I walked back with him ... sort of a philosophical discussion as why, you know, why should I go out there tomorrow if they're not even going to have anyone of equivalent rank, and, I encouraged him to go out, but I said, you know, you, you could set a good example ... for other people to follow and he goes, "you know, yeah I guess you're right, you know, I really should go out there and of course I'll do my best too."

IO: Okay. Alright so you got back to the hotel, um, and it's about 3:00 or so, uh, you have a show time in about, uh, three hours...

██████: 7:30, yeah, yeah; four and a half hours, yeah.³¹ (Ex 22:41)

When asked where he went after the La Cantina, Maj Gen Carey stated, "Back to the, back to my hotel." (Ex 15:42) When asked if he made any stops along the way, Maj Gen Carey said, "No, sorry." (Ex 15:42) When asked if any of his group went with him, Maj Gen Carey said, "I was never alone." (Ex 15:42) When asked who was with him after leaving the La Cantina, he could not recall with certainty and recalled events from the previous night. (Ex 15:42-43) Maj Gen Carey stated that he thought they may have taken a taxi home but that it could have been the first or second night. (Ex 15:43)

Departure from the Marriott the morning of 17th

b6
b7c

The morning of 17 Jul 13 the departure time was set up as 0730hrs and at 0730hrs everyone one was in the lobby ready to depart except for Maj Gen Carey. Mr ██████ went up to Maj Gen Carey's room to make sure he was ready to go.³² (Ex 21:31-32) Maj Gen Carey arrived in the lobby at approximately 0745hrs. (Ex 21:33) When Maj Gen Carey arrived, Lt Col ██████ stated that he looked rough that morning, "So apparently those guys stayed out most of the night. I don't know if they stayed out all night, three quarters of the night or whatever but they stayed out late because the next morning they looked... their eyes were all blood shot and they looked like they were exhausted, those three [Maj Gen Carey, Mr. ██████, Mr. ██████]." (Ex 16:23)

Maj Gen Carey stated he didn't know what the show time was that morning but he was on time. He also stated that he had about four hours of sleep and that he did not eat breakfast. (Ex 15:44-45) Regarding the ride to Sergeiv Posad, Lt Col ██████ stated, "The first few minutes he [Maj Gen Carey] talked and then he slept most of the way up to the place again." (Ex 16:24)

³¹ LTC ██████ testified that Mr. ██████ told him that Maj Gen Carey, upon returning to the Marriott stayed outside talking with cab drivers before going to bed. (Ex 17:30)

³² Mr. ██████ testified that, "██████ told me later on that during that [during the] 20 minutes he was, um, discussing with the General how important it was for him to show up on this second day, and to get him to come down and participate on the second day. And as my notes say he was 20 minutes late to the lobby." (Ex 18:15)

Briefing at Sergeiv Posad by the MOD on the 17th

The pre-exercise briefings on 17 Jul 13 were similar in nature to those on 16 Jul 13, however there was a General Officer in charge of the RF delegation and the meetings took on a more stoic quality. (Ex 16:29) Lt Col ██████ stated that Maj Gen Carey was having issues with the RF translator that morning:

██████: She [RF translator] said something and he... the General [Maj Gen Carey] knew a little Russian and he said that's not what... that's not what I said. And it surprised us all in the room and then our translator explained, well you don't say verbatim what you say, ... So he [Maj Gen Carey] actually corrected her at one point and I think that didn't go over very well....

IO: With who?

██████: The whole group because they kind of looked like why are you questioning my translator. Remember I said the new General was there and he was a little more stoic or he kind of said who are you to question our people? He didn't say that but he kind of gave you that look and our translator fixed it. ... And then they were all kind of happy about that and said okay, and then they made a little joke like, good job General, you know some Russian, we are happy. So it actually kind of went bad at first but then turned into a positive because the General surprised them that he knew a little Russian because nobody on the team did other than the translator and so it kind of turned into a positive. But it was just kind of... it just didn't go as well. (Ex 16:29-30)

b6
b7c

During the discussion of convoy communications, Maj Gen Carey used the American Verizon commercial which included the phrase, "Can you hear me now?" to try and make a point. LTC ██████ recalled the incident:

So, Gen Carey was trying to make a point [that] you have dead spots in your radios because you know, that's a common problem with anybody, any person that has a radio... there are dead spots and long distances. That's a common problem. And they [the RF] were like no... and then so here is where him [Maj Gen Carey] and the translator [Mr. ██████] just... it kind of was bad. And like I said Gen Carey looked... that morning he looked like he was out all night but he just looked tired too. You know? He is an older gentleman and uh, so he went to the translator and the old Verizon commercial, can you hear me now? He used that. So he asked the translator, can you hear me now? And the translator, yes sir, I hear you. Can you hear me now? Sir, I hear you. Can you hear me now? And the General, I think, was trying to be funny but the translator, our American translator didn't have a clue what he was saying. Sir, I hear you. I, I don't get what are you saying and he goes you know, on your convoy, can you hear me now? And then, he kind of said... I think he finally got it. Actually I pulled the translator aside at break and I said hey, what the General was trying to say was... he was trying to be funny but it didn't come across that way. He was doing that can you hear me

now thing and I just put it together because it's easier when you are not the guy on the spot, you know? If you are in a room and you are watching two people's interdynamics... I get what he is saying but the translator just didn't get it. And the Russians were looking at him like are you crazy? Why do you keep asking your translator the same question over and over? So it did look a little forceful from the General at that point. (Ex 16:25-26)

...

I said, that was very arduous going through those translators but I think the General was a little... been out all night, whatever, but he wasn't you know... didn't have a full eight hours sleep, wasn't ready to go for this meeting type of thing. So that was a little... because actually one of the other participants on the U.S. team asked me a question like what is wrong with him? You know, doesn't he realize that they were looking at him? I'm like well, yeah, I guess. I couldn't really pull myself away because I was sitting right aside of him for most of this, so I was trying to help the translator understand. It's hard to translate for the General and be respectful, you know, in a meeting like that. (Ex 16:25-26)

Also during the meeting, two Russian individuals, sitting on the row behind the RF General, were talking amongst themselves while Maj Gen Carey was speaking. (Ex 16:31) The perceived level of distraction varied between the witness' testimonies. Ms. [REDACTED] described her point of view, "I was closer to them than he [Maj Gen Carey] was. It wasn't terribly distracting but at one point he [Maj Gen Carey] just started basically chastising them for having a side conversation that he found it very distracting and he would appreciate it if they would stop talking." (Ex 20:18) Another perspective from Lt Col [REDACTED], "Gen Carey did [ask] to their General and it was a little forceful. I mean, he was like could you *please* ask those gentlemen to be quiet while I'm speaking?" (Ex 16:32) Additionally, Ms [REDACTED] commented on the way she felt about how Maj Gen Carey requested the two individual to be quiet, stating "I wanted to crawl under the table. I was mortified." (Ex 20:18)

b6
b7c

Maj Gen Carey stated he felt fatigued that morning. (Ex 15:47) He thought he was engaged in what was going on. (Ex 15:48) He felt the briefings were better that day but still sophomoric. (Ex 15:47) Maj Gen Carey stated that he never had a problem with the RF translator nor did he specifically remember saying *Can you hear me now*, "so if I said that phrase I, I couldn't tell you," and followed with, "I wouldn't find it odd or offensive if I did." (Ex 15:49) Maj Gen Carey did remember asking the RF General to tell his people to be quiet. (Ex 15:49)

When the morning briefings ended, both the RF and US delegations went to the live fire exercise which was uneventful for purposes of this investigation. (Ex 22:50) Following the exercise, the same group met with some of the exercise participants and gave out awards and had a version of a hot wash. Following the awards presentations, the US and RF delegation went to a Russian hotel, in Sergeiv Posad, for a lunch banquet. (Ex 22:52)

33

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

Lunch banquet in the town of Sergeiv Posad on the 17th

The banquet on the second day was similar in nature to that of the first day but it was more formal and ornate. (Ex 22:53) Mr. [REDACTED] stated that the number of toasts increased for this banquet: "I'd say at least twenty-five toasts were raised. I mean, virtually every single member of the Russian delegation and every single member of the US delegation raised a toast, except for me." (Ex 22:54) Also similar to the first day, was that the RF was not pushing the US delegation members to drink. (Ex 22:53) During this event, LTC [REDACTED] indicated that Maj Gen Carey was not only having the vodka during the toasts but probably had wine with the meal. (Ex 17:36) LTC [REDACTED] also stated that Maj Gen Carey interrupted the RF during their toasts to the point, he believes, the RF members were a little irritated. (Ex 17:36) LTC [REDACTED] also stated that Maj Gen Carey's speech was slurred, his eyes were bloodshot, he was flush, and he appeared to be a little intoxicated. (Ex 17:36-37)

When asked about whether he felt pressure to drink, Maj Gen Carey stated:

Sure. I mean, so, yeah, right, it's expected that you will [toast]. The nice thing is that the toasting glasses are not full ounce glasses, you know, they are a portion of that which is good. Um, and there is a sense of duty to participate in the toasting, everybody participated in the toasting they also had nonalcoholic beverages there as well, water and Coke Lite. Um, so, but yeah, absolutely. I mean that's, that's the deal when you go to a Russian toasting event you're into the toasts. (Ex 15:51)

b6
b7c

Maj Gen Carey stated that he only had about half a dozen shots or 8 ounces and sipped on some toasts and finished his glass on others. He also stated that he didn't remember the particulars of any of his toasts other than them being about camaraderie. (Ex 15:52-53) When asked if he was intoxicated when he left the banquet he declined to answer. (Ex 15:53)

Return to the Marriott on the 17th

After the banquet, Lt Col [REDACTED] recalled that Maj Gen Carey slept on the ride to the hotel. (Ex 16:37) Upon arrival at the hotel, Mr. [REDACTED] stated that some team members went to the Marriott executive lounge area to have some cognac left over from the banquet. (Ex 22:56)

Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he thought Maj Gen Carey was there as well. (Ex 21:36) While some members participated in this gathering, Ms. [REDACTED] stated, "I basically just went into my hotel room and hid there until the next morning because I didn't want to end up in another situation like the night before. And so I basically just hid that night." (Ex 20:20)

LTC [REDACTED] was with Maj Gen Carey most of the evening and stated,

And then at one point we went down into the lobby and we were down there for quite a while. I think we ended up staying down there honestly until four in the morning but that, I had... I think I had a beer at the lounge, at the Executive Suite but I didn't have any more to drink after that. I was drinking water and then tea from the bar area. (Ex 17:39)

When asked if Maj Gen Carey had any alcohol in the lobby area, LTC [REDACTED] stated, "Over that whole course of the rest of that evening, I saw him have two glasses of wine." (Ex 17:39) LTC [REDACTED] stated he went to pack for the trip home and that Maj Gen Carey rode the elevator with him to pack as well. (Ex 17:39)

Maj Gen Carey stated that he stayed up all night to get his body clock back in sync. (Ex 15:55) And that he stayed in the hotel lobby talking with LTC [REDACTED] and other members of the US delegation the entire night. (Ex 15:55-56) Maj Gen Carey stated that the cigar sales lady spent most of the night with them sitting on the couch in the main Marriott lobby. (Ex 15:55) Maj Gen Carey stated, "she was asking questions about physics and optics and I was like, dude, this doesn't normally happen...." (Ex 15:55) Maj Gen Carey stated the he talked more to Lt Col [REDACTED] but it appears to the IO that Maj Gen Carey did not find it concerning enough to leave the area. (Ex 15:55) Maj Gen Carey also added, "And I had hot tea, uh, while I was waiting for the morning to come and refreshed myself and got ready for my trip home." (Ex 15:56) The departure time arrived and the US delegation departed the Marriott and Moscow without further incident.

Additional comments by witnesses regarding Maj Gen Carey's actions from 14-18 Jul 13

b6
b7c

Ms. [REDACTED] stated:

I was shocked. I kept waiting for a realization to come that his behavior was totally out of bounds and it never happened. And you know, I can see how something like this could be perceived as having an axe to grind... absolutely not the case here. I'm just more disappointed and really I was very angry that I was put in this position ... this could have ended up so badly um, with the women and just you know, I don't know if relations have been damaged with the Russians. It certainly wasn't the impression I would have wanted to leave. It's just disappointing more than anything else but in terms of anything else that happened.... (Ex 20:24)

Lt Col [REDACTED] stated:

[T]he only sad part is I was a brand new guy over there and it was one of the best experiences of my life to go to Russia and I've been protecting nuclear weapons my whole career and they used to be my enemy and now to see it from that, and I saw a lot of... so many positive things out of this trip, it's just a shame that the General probably wasn't on his game or somebody else saw him as you know, could have done a better job. It's all opinion. Personally, he probably could have done better but we all can. I don't know how I would handle myself in his situation. Probably wouldn't have had as

35

This is a protected document. It will not be released (in whole or in part), reproduced, or given additional dissemination (in whole or in part) outside of the inspector general channels without prior approval of The Inspector General (SAF/IG) or designee.

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO)

many... you know, been out as late as him but did he act bad? He probably just could have acted better. (Ex 16:45)

LTC [REDACTED] commented on whether he agreed with several comments made to him by Ms. [REDACTED] regarding Maj Gen Carey's poor behavior:

Um, to a degree but um, I know Gen Carey and how he is normally better than she does so I think some of it... I mean, she probably had some legitimate complaints but I think some of it was also just her not knowing his personality and his demeanor as well as I do. But I don't think she was completely unfounded. (Ex 17:42)

Mr. [REDACTED] added as his final thoughts on Maj Gen Carey's actions:

I'll tell you that when the, when the conference was done and we were in the airplane I didn't want to have anything to do with him.... (Ex 18:27)

Mr. [REDACTED] noted:

IO: Okay. Uh, anybody else in the group in the American delegation say anything to you about his behavior?

[REDACTED]: Well, it, it seemed that, um, it seemed that a couple of people were concerned, uh, in the group. And, uh, they seemed to think that, I guess, Gen Carey was, uh, behaving somehow maybe inappropriately or, but, you know, they were, they were just voicing their opinion.

b6
b7c

IO: Okay so they were telling you that or, in, in discussion or one-on-one?

[REDACTED]: Yeah, just, just, just in discussion, um, they, they were discussing that and they were discussing, uh, one individual mentioned that he, the second day in the morning, you know, when he came down late the second day again, that morning's discussion was, uh, a little difficult, and, and, yeah, it was a little difficult, the second morning was a little difficult, you know, he, he was asking a lot of questions, but he seemed to be struggling for words at certain points and, and trying to find the right word to describe his thought, and, and making trying to, trying to express his thoughts, you know with his hands a few times and, and gestures and so, so that, that was why that, you know, that people felt, sort of maybe he wasn't behaving himself well, but I, you know, I, I can't vouch for that, and I don't know one way or another. (Ex 22:59-60)

Maj Gen Carey stated at the end of his interview:

[S]o, a lot of questions about timeline and what, and that is something in my scheme of activity I don't really focus on and I've got an Exec and a secretary and when you're over there you've got handlers that tell [you] do this, do that and movements, so I don't

recall the timelines. I was never, never out of, uh, uh, I was never without somebody with the crowd, with the American traveling party, with the exception of the few hours on the day, the hours prior to departure. (Ex 15:58)

...

And so, so, if my behavior which I'm alleged to, um, conduct unbecoming an officer, um, there was never a time when anyone spoke up, interviewed, commented, gave me feedback, you might not wanna, maybe this doesn't look right, this could be embarrassing to our effort. So, that, that doesn't say anything other than I was never alone, and nobody critiqued. So, uh, as far as wingman support, teamwork, I travel with an aide, a senior NCO, almost all the time. I was expecting a Wing Commander and a former Wing Commander to be with me. I got two Lieutenant Colonels and two civilians who I have, um, almost no knowledge of with the exception of one Lieutenant Colonel and one civilian who was my escort and who recommended certain places to go, and he's been in Moscow a lot. So, so those kind of things build a context. As far as the toasting goes, everybody toasted, um, yeah, you feel pressure to, sure you do because that's part of the role and there's a history there. Um, so being fatigued and going through all that, uh, I may have made comments that somebody took offense to. If they did, they did not bring it to my attention. So, I certainly apologize if I offended somebody. I don't think anything I said was offensive or inappropriate, but I suppose the conduct unbecoming paragraph is written in very general for, uh, however you characterize it to be. I thought that from the DTRA report it was, in their eyes, a successful event. In my eyes it was an awful lot of expenditure of time and energy for very little gain. Um, so trying to make it a congenial event, if it wasn't gonna be a professional development event was actually on my mind. Might as well break down social barriers and get to know one another if we're not going to do real work anyway. (Ex 15:59)

2nd Analysis

The IO noted during the subject interview that Gen Carey either had a poor recall of significant events, perhaps due to his alcohol consumption, or was untruthful during the interview. His testimony frequently differed greatly from that of other witnesses, for example, regarding trying to play with the band, talking about not attending the second day of the exercise, or spending so much time with the two foreign national women on the night of the 16th. Maj Gen Carey's mood appeared to change during his interview. Despite being informed the interview, which began at 1300, would take at least two hours, he scheduled another meeting for 1400 that same afternoon. As such, the interview was put on hold while Maj Gen Carey called to cancel his 1400 appointment.

When determining whether a violation of Article 133 of the UCMJ, conduct unbecoming an officer and a gentleman, has occurred both elements of the offense must be considered. The elements of Article 133 are: (1) That the accused did or omitted to do certain acts; and (2) That,

under the circumstances, these acts or omissions constituted conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman. (Ex 9:1)

The IO applied the elements of the Article 133 as an acid test to determine if Maj Gen Carey violated Art 133, Conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman.

1) That the accused did or omitted to do certain acts.

Maj Gen Carey was late for the scheduled departure from the hotel on both days of the exercise. He was 45 minutes late for departure on the first day of the exercise (Ex 20:9) and he was 15-20 minutes late for departure on the second day despite having been told of the importance of being on time. (Ex 21:32)

Maj Gen Carey frequently interrupted his Russian hosts and the Russian translator during briefings. (Ex 20:11, 18-19)

Maj Gen Carey made comments regarding Syria and Mr. Eric Snowden to the RF delegation. (Ex 22:25-26)

Maj Gen Carey consumed alcoholic beverages to the extent that it impacted his conduct during briefings, during the banquets, during the tour of the monastery, and on the walk to Red Square for dinner. (Ex 16:17, Ex 18:12) The IO noted that, based on his poor recollection of significant events during the subject interview, Maj Gen Carey may have consumed an amount significant enough to affect his recall.

Maj Gen Carey had repeated contact with two foreign national women while in Russia, despite by his own admission knowing that they were somewhat suspect. (Ex 15:14) He went to La Cantina knowing the two women would be there. (Ex 15:16) Maj Gen Carey stayed after most of the US delegation left to spend time with the two foreign national women and discussed, at least to some extent, his trip with them. (Ex 21:28-29)

Maj Gen Carey expressed dissatisfaction with his military leadership and commented on his organization's poor morale to members of the US delegation. (Ex 20:8)

Maj Gen Carey repeatedly made statements to US delegation members that the Nuclear Security Exercise was a waste of time and money. (Ex 15:24, Ex 18:13, Ex 20:14-15) Maj Gen Carey also made statements to delegation members in which he threatened to not attend the second day of the exercise. (Ex 17:23, Ex 21:29, Ex 22:41)

2) That, under the circumstances, these acts or omissions constituted conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman.

The IO considered the language in Art 133 of the UCMJ, which describes the nature of the offense and states that "conduct violative of this article is action of behavior, in an official capacity which, in dishonoring or disgracing the officer personally, seriously compromises the person's character as a gentleman." (Ex 9:1) The IO also focused on the language in Art 133, which states that there are moral attributes common to the ideal officer and perfect gentleman, a lack of which is indicated by, among other things, indecorum, and below which the personal standards of an officer cannot fall without seriously compromising the person's standing as an officer or character as a gentleman. The language describing the nature of the offense states specifically that "this article prohibits conduct by a commissioned officer, cadet, or midshipman which, taking all the circumstances into consideration, is thus compromising." (9:1)

The IO focused on the aspect of "indecorum," as defined in the Merriam-Webster dictionary, when comparing Maj Gen Carey's conduct during the 14 – 18 Jul 13 TDY to the elements of Art 133.³³ Indecorum as defined as:

1. Something that is indecorous
2. Something that is impropriety

Indecorous is further defined as:

1. Indecorous (not decorous, conflicting with accepted standards of good conduct or good taste).
2. Lack of decorum; impropriety (rude or immoral behavior, improper behavior, a rude or improper quality, a wrong or immoral act, an improper act).

b6
b7c

The IO found that by a preponderance of the evidence, Maj Gen Carey's behavior, from 14-18 July, was indecorous, as defined by Webster's dictionary, and was of such a nature as to seriously compromise his standing as an officer and character as a gentleman, based on the following:

The event was a US-RF Bilateral Presidential Commission, Military Cooperation Working Group Event. (Ex 7:2) This exercise was in an international setting and took place at the RF MOD Security Assessment and Training Center and Abramovo Counter-Terrorism Training Center, in Sergeiv Posad, Russian Federation. (Ex 7:2) Russian participants included Ms. [REDACTED] General [REDACTED], Colonel [REDACTED], and Colonel [REDACTED]. (Ex 7:6)

Maj Gen Carey was the senior US military member and US Delegation lead. The US delegation consisted of representatives from the Joint Staff J3, OASD for Nuclear Matters, OPNAV N97G (Nuclear Weapons Safety/Security & Policy), AFGSC/A7S (Nuclear Weapons

³³ Definition obtained from <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/indecorum>

Security), and the Department of Energy/NNSA NA-251. (Ex 7:3) As such, his actions and comments could have been viewed as representative of the entire US delegation, US Air Force, the Department of Defense, the Department of Energy, and/or the US government.

Maj Gen Carey stated that he did not have guidance regarding expectations for him as the delegation lead. (Ex 15:6) However, the IO determined he was still bound to act in accordance with standards of conduct required of officers

Based on the descriptions of Maj Gen Carey's behavior provided by witnesses during the investigation, the IO found that Maj Gen Carey was frequently rude to both his fellow delegates and to his Russian hosts during the exercise and briefings. Witnesses testified to the reaction of RF personnel to Maj Gen Carey's tardiness and behavior during briefings and banquets, which indicated they found his behavior to be rude and/or inappropriate. (Ex 20:11; 18-19) In particular, the IO noted the Russian reaction to Maj Gen Carey's comments about Syria and Eric Snowden. (Ex 22:25-26) He was similarly rude to his fellow US delegates on the walk to Red Square, when he was unable to keep up, pouted and sulked, and then complained repeatedly about the exercise itself. (Ex 16:19-20, Ex 18:12, Ex 21:40, Ex 20:14) Maj Gen Carey engaged in inappropriate or improper behavior when he chose to meet up with and continued to associate with the foreign national women, as discussed above, especially given his own acknowledgement that the women were suspect. (Ex 15:14-15) Maj Gen Carey kept late hours (Ex 16:23, 27-28; Ex 17:30) and consumed alcohol every day on the trip (Ex 15:9, 14, 28, Ex 16:15, Ex 22:53-54, Ex 21:29, Ex 17:39) even to the point where it was visibly noticeable even to the point that one witness was concerned that Maj Gen Carey needed assistance standing. (Ex 18:12) Finally, he expressed dissatisfaction with his senior leadership, which at least one witness found to be very inappropriate. (Ex 20:8)

The IO highlighted a number of statements from witnesses regarding Maj Gen Carey's conduct that the IO felt most succinctly expressed the inappropriateness of Maj Gen Carey's behavior, and which the IO felt best expressed the lack of officership and gentlemanliness on Maj Gen Carey's part during the TDY:

"What's wrong with him?" (Ex 16:26)

"I wanted to crawl under the table..." (Ex 20:18)

"And the Russians were looking at him like "are you crazy"?" (Ex 16:26)

"When the conference was done and we were in the airplane I didn't want to have anything to do with him." (Ex 18:27)

"[I] went into my hotel room and hid there until the next morning because I didn't want to end up in another situation like the night before." (Ex 20:20)

"I've never been more embarrassed professionally in my life with a senior member." (Ex 18:16)

Therefore, taking all of the facts and circumstances into consideration, the preponderance of the evidence indicates Maj Gen Carey's conduct during the TDY constituted indecorum. Maj Gen Carey's behavior was well below that which is expected of officers and was of a serious enough nature that it disgraced him as an officer and seriously compromised his standing as an officer.

CONCLUSION.

Maj Gen Carey exceeded the limits of accepted standards of good conduct and proper behavior. The IO found by a preponderance of evidence, based upon sworn testimony, the allegation that Maj Gen Michael J. Carey engaged in inappropriate behavior during a temporary duty assignment from 14 to 18 July 13 in violation of Article 133, Uniform Code of Military Justice, conduct unbecoming an officer and a gentleman was **SUBSTANTIATED**.

VI. SUMMARY

ALLEGATION. That Major General Michael J. Carey engaged in inappropriate behavior during a temporary duty assignment from 14 to 18 Jul 13, in violation of Article 133, Uniform Code of Military Justice, Conduct unbecoming an officer and gentleman was **SUBSTANTIATED.**

- The preponderance of evidence supported the conclusion that Maj Gen Carey acted in a manner that exceeded the limits of accepted standards of good conduct and proper behavior.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] Colonel, USAF
Investigating Officer
Directorate of Senior Official Inquiries

b6
b7c

I have reviewed this Report of Investigation and the accompanying legal review and I concur with their findings.

[REDACTED]

STEPHEN P. MUELLER
Lieutenant General, USAF
The Inspector General